



The Chairman and Members

The Advisory Council on the Environment

Professor LAM Kwan-sing, Paul, J.P. (Chairman)
Professor CHAU Kwai-cheong, J.P. (Deputy Chairman)
Ms. AU Pui-yee, Teresa
Dr. CHAN YUEN Tak-fai, Dorothy, B.B.S.
Mr. CHOW Vee-tsung, Oscar
Professor FUNG Tung
Ms. HO Siu-fong, Betty
Mr. Hans Michael JEBSEN, B.B.S.
Mr. LAU Che-feng, Edwin, M.H.
Professor LEE Hun-wei, Joseph
Professor LI Xiang-dong
Dr. LO Wai-kwok, B.B.S., M.H., J.P.
Dr. MAN Chi-sum, J.P.
Miss NG Yuen-ting, Yolanda
Dr. TAM Yat-cheung, Alfred
Mr. TSANG Kam-lam, J.P.
Dr. WILLIS YAU Sheung-mui, Carrie, S.B.S., J.P.
Mr. WONG Ka-wo, Simon, J.P.
Ms. YAU Lai-ping, Pansy
Dr. YAU Wing-kwong
Dr. YEP Kin-man, Ray
Professor YU Tak-sun, Ignatius
Secretary: Deputy Director of Environmental Protection (3)

Waste Management Subcommittee

Dr. YAU Wing-kwong* (Chairman)
Mr. CHOW Vee-tsung, Oscar
Mr. LAU Che-feng, Edwin, M.H.
Dr. LO Wai-kwok, B.B.S., M.H., J.P.
Dr. MAN Chi-sum, J.P.
Miss NG Yuen-ting, Yolanda
Mr. TSANG Kam-lam, J.P.
Dr. WILLIS YAU Sheung-mui, Carrie, S.B.S., J.P.
Mr. WONG Ka-wo, Simon, J.P.
Professor YU Tak-sun, Ignatius

Legco Panel on Environmental Affairs

pse@enb.gov.hk ; ps@enb.gov.hk ; dse@enb.gov.hk ; ps@enb.gov.hk ; lee.potts@aecom.com ; bhpksl@cityu.edu.hk ;
ddep@epd.gov.hk ; panel_ea@legco.gov.hk

http://www.epd.gov.hk/epd/english/boards/advisory_council/maincontent.html

8/F Eastwood Centre - 5, A Kung Ngam Village Road - Shaukeiwan, Hong Kong

Tel: (+852) 26930136 Fax: (+852) 26027153 Email: chair@cleartheair.org.hk
www.cleartheair.org.hk



Dear Sir,

21st December 2011

We refer to the decision of the Hong Kong Government through its advisors AECOM to construct an integrated waste to energy incineration plant at a man-made island adjoining Shek Kwu Chau.

The chosen technology is a moving gate conveyor incineration system wherein air is blown over and under the waste conveyor grate to increase and maintain burn temperature.

Sadly this technology is now out of date and creates unnecessary emissions and logistical re-handling of toxic residual ash, then necessitates landfill of the residue, exacerbated by the chosen remote location and double handling to and from the island site by polluting diesel barges.

This is like choosing horses, carts and rickshaws to ply the bus routes of Nathan Road. They worked well in their day too. But technology has advanced considerably since previous decisions were made:

http://www.epd.gov.hk/epd/wqo_review/tr/submission/ACE-166-minutes-web.pdf

Page 8 Item 4 In Attendance for Agenda Item 4:

Mr Albert LAM, JP Deputy Director of Environmental Protection (2), EPD

Mr Vincent TANG Assistant Director (Nature Conservation & Infrastructure Planning), EPD

Mr LUI Ping-hon Principal Environmental Protection Officer (Infrastructure Planning), EPD

Dr Ken LUK Regional Director, AECOM Asia Co. Ltd. (AECOM)

Ms Echo LEONG Associate, AECOM

Dr Lee POTTS Technical Specialist, AECOM

We should make use of this new technology. With due respect to AECOM we would ask all the members of the Advisory Panel to consider more modern Plasma Arc Gasification technology ahead of the outdated moving gate bonfire option now proposed.

The Plasma Arc emissions are far less, the residues are effectively heat fused lava type rock that can be crushed and used in construction, the plasma burn temperatures are magnitudes higher to destroy dioxins and the resultant energy generation is maximised.

Herewith are some self explanatory videos which describe Plasma Arc Gasification plants:

PLASMA Arc Gasification incineration and syngas – the future - now

<http://www.youtube.com/watch?v=cqrAWYtd6RI&feature=related>

<http://www.youtube.com/watch?v=6QJscVTM9bY>

<http://www.youtube.com/watch?v=8DLP5A2xz-c&feature=endscreen&NR=1>

Other relevant suggestions are attached herewith.

8/F Eastwood Centre - 5, A Kung Ngam Village Road - Shaukeiwan, Hong Kong

Tel: (+852) 26930136 Fax: (+852) 26027153 Email: chair@cleartheair.org.hk
www.cleartheair.org.hk



South China Morning Post

Plan for super incinerator should be a burning issue

Howard Winn
Updated on Dec 21, 2011

The government is steamrolling through its plan for a super incinerator on the island of Shek Kwu Chau despite widespread objections to the location and the technology it is to use. At an estimated HK\$13 billion, it is going to be one of the world's most expensive waste disposal units.

The decision has not been formally taken, but dredging has already started at Shek Kwu Chau. So much for the government's respect for due process.

The other site the government said it was considering was Tsang Tsui near the landfill site. However, this site falls within the ever-so-charming Heung Yee Kuk's "sphere of influence". Kuk leader Lau Wong-fat sits on the Executive Council and, more importantly, is capable of delivering votes. As a result, much of the New Territories is virtually a no-go area for the administration. Witness, for example, its torpidity in dealing with illegal structures and the small house policy.

The technical grounds as to why the government should consider alternatives to the incinerator were well set out in a recent letter to the *South China Morning Post*. It says the technology is old and Hong Kong would be better served by using plasma arc incinerators, which are cheaper and more effective, producing less air pollution.

The government is under the illusion that its proposed super incinerator is both clean and beautiful and will become a tourist attraction. But when asked why this attraction wasn't being built in Central, the response from a government official was that it wouldn't get past the air

8/F Eastwood Centre - 5, A Kung Ngam Village Road - Shaukeiwan, Hong Kong

Tel: (+852) 26930136 Fax: (+852) 26027153 Email: chair@cleartheair.org.hk
www.cleartheair.org.hk



quality objectives. Once again, the health of the people in Hong Kong is being put at risk by the narrow political ends of the government.

Much easier to ignore the NGOs and objections from Cheung Chau and South Lantau than deal with hordes of revolting Heung Yee Kuk.

Will Secretary of Environment Edward Yau Tang-wah be as vocal on this issue as he has been on electricity tariffs? Strangely, we predict a deafening silence on this.

Yours faithfully,

James Middleton

Chairman
Clear the Air NGO and Charity



8/F Eastwood Centre - 5, A Kung Ngam Village Road - Shaukeiwan, Hong Kong

Tel: (+852) 26930136 Fax: (+852) 26027153 Email: chair@cleartheair.org.hk
www.cleartheair.org.hk